

Creating knowledge together

## **Fostering Empathy With 360-Cinematic VR**

Analyzing the Multidimensional Construct of Empathy and Perceived Resonance

Martin Smith-Gahrsen, University of Agder, Kristiansand, Norway



# Virtual reality – a hype or hit?

#### Virtual reality – a hype or hit?

#### A hype?

- Commercially driven
  entertainment technology
- Without valid educational benefits
- Lack of software that suits educational purposes
- Too costly and technologically advanced for use in any school

#### A hit?

- Immersion, interaction, and user involvement
- A sense of presence provided
- Co-creating ecologically valid content
- Combining VR-experiences with high-taxonomic activities

#### What is 360-cinematic VR?

- The term «360-cinematic VR» denotes an experience in which users wear head-mounted displays (HMD or VR headsets) that enable them, by turning their heads, to gaze around in a virtual or simulated world of moving images.
- This conceptually and technically differs from «360-interactive VR», where users can interact directly with the narrative by manipulating protagonists or trajectories virtually.

## Enhancing empathy to prevent bullying in school

- Studies have shown that developing cognitive and affective empathy is negatively correlated with bullying behaviour and victimization.
- There is a **persistent call for innovative ways** to implement measures to reduce the prevalence of bullying in schools.
- VR has proven to be successful in eliciting empathic responses.



### **VR and empathy**

- VR as an «empathy machine»
- Empathy has been referred to as "the ability to comprehend and respond to the emotions, thoughts, and experiences of others" (Yalçın & DiPaola, 2020)
- VR may enhance **cognitive empathy** as virtual 360-degree scenes provide viewers with vivid visual information, depicting detailed and realistic portrayals of the protagonists' situations.
- However, VR may even elicit **emotional empathy**, as the sense of presence and immersion in virtual scenes can transmit the protagonists' feelings through emotional contagion.





#### **Can VR enhance cognitive empathy?**

- Martingano et al. (2021) argue that eliciting cognitive empathy requires effortful mentalizing, "such as using one's own imagination to construct others' experiences".
- Cognitive empathy is typically developed through **reading fiction or acting**, as the reader or actor must interpret the fictitious characters' motives and intentions.
- This is not provided for in VR experiences, as the vivid and immersive virtual scenes explicitly display the characters' thoughts and feelings, affecting viewers emotionally but not cognitively.
- Martingano et al. advocate for a dual approach to enhancing empathy, incorporating both cognitive and emotional aspects—a so-called "two-pronged" approach.
- This could be achieved by adding mentalizing tasks to the VR experience, such as asking "how a virtual person is thinking or feeling, asking them to predict what to do next, or explaining why they acted as they did" [10].

#### **Research questions**



- In what ways can co-creating and engaging with cinematic VR experiences involving ethically complex situations foster empathic responses among lower secondary students in a Norwegian classroom? (RQ1).
- Can co-creating VR-based teaching and learning resources create moments of resonance for the students? (RQ2).

#### **Empahty as a multidimensional construct**

M. H. Davis (1980; 1983) developed a multidimensional approach to individual differences in empathy alongside an interpersonal reactivity index (IRI), measuring four dimensions of empathy:

- 1) Perspective Taking (PT) involves the ability to adopt the psychological viewpoint of others
- 2) Fantasy (FS) measures the tendency to be transported by imagination into the feelings and actions of fictional characters in books, movies, and plays
- 3) Empathic Concern (EC) assesses "other-oriented" feelings or sympathy and concern for unfortunate individuals
- 4) Personal Distress (PD) measures the extent to which "self-oriented" feelings of personal anxiety and unease arise in tense interpersonal settings.

#### Empathy aligned with social competence

PT: A correlation between PT and the **capacity for non-egocentric behaviour**, as PT enables "an individual to anticipate the behaviour and reactions of others, thereby facilitating smoother and more rewarding interpersonal relationships"

FS: Individuals with high degrees of fantasy abilities are "more susceptible to emotional responses and thereby exhibit greater sensitivity", both self-oriented and other-oriented.

EC: Is linked to **high levels of selflessness and concern for others** and is negatively associated with boastfulness and egotism. However, EC may also be connected to shyness and social anxiety.

PD: **Correlates with social dysfunction**, as individuals with high levels of PD tend to be "more shy, more socially anxious, and less extraverted".



#### Hartmut Rosa's resonance

Rosa explains the occurrence of perceived resonance as a fourfold process comprising moments (Ge. Momente) of affection, self-efficacy, transformation, and uncontrollability.

- First, resonance is perceived as being affected (Ge. Affizierung) or touched (Ge. Berührtwerden) by people, incidents, stories, or music, either emotionally or existentially.
- Second, a response is triggered, either as engagement, agency, or personal investment (Ge. Selbstwirksamkeit).
- Third, something in **the person changes or is transformed**, whether it be values, understanding, or attitudes (Ge. Anverwandlung).
- Lastly, Rosa emphasizes that experiences of resonance are unpredictable (Ge. Unverfügbarkeit). If someone tries to control the resonance instrumentally, it vanishes.



#### The novelty of this study

The novelty of this contribution lies in:

- The didactic co-creative design process
- The qualitative analysis of the students' responses, employing a typological thematic analysis derived from Davis' multidimensional construct of empathy.



#### **Co-creation process**

Co-production of the 360-videos

Co-writing manuscripts

Intervention where the students experienced and discussed the ethical dilemmas in the 360-videos

## Five 360-videos displaying ethically challenging situations

Narratives of chauvinistic bullying, group-based ostracizing, or use of derogatory or sexist language.

**Video 1:** Groups of male peers delivering sexualized comments to one of the passing girls.

**Video 2:** Two female students converse about one of them having been filmed naked in the wardrobe, and that the video has been circulated on a social media platform.

**Video 3:** A female student is assaulted with sexual comments, but no one responds, including a group of teachers on recess supervision duty who are busy scrolling their smartphones.

**Video 4 and 5:** Displaying the perspective of the one not invited to a party (short and long version)



### Film 2 Snikfilmet i garderoben

### Film 4 B Er du ikke invitert på festen?

#### **Method: Typological Thematic Analysis**

- Two lower secondary school-classes (N = 45) participated in the study.
- The classes were selected through convenience sampling.
- A qualitative and exploratory research design was employed.
- The group discussions (N = 31) and subsequent group interviews (N = 7) were analyzed using a theoretically driven or typological thematic analysis, employing operational criteria selected from Davis' IRI model.

#### **Empathy dimensions employed in the analysis**

Empathy dimension	Guiding explanation	Examples of corresponding IRI- questions
Perspective taking (PT)	I put myself in the participants' shoes in the simulated story.	8. Before criticizing somebody, I try to imagine how I would feel if I were in their place. (PT)
Fantasy (FS)	I was involved in the feelings of the participants in the simulated story.	16. After seeing a play or movie, I have felt as though I were one of the characters. (FS)
Emotional Concern (EC)	I felt sorry for the protagonist in the simulated story.	2. I often have tender, concerned feelings for people less fortunate than me. (EC)
Personal distress (PD)	I felt bad when I experienced the simulated story.	10. I sometimes feel helpless when I am in the middle of a very emotional situation. (PD)

#### 239.025 12:52.72 57.17 64 55 V 10V 2002 860.01 00, 10 00, 10 00, 10 .00 38 25. 5 (S) 10.0 0. 6 615.2 2960 241.65 100 67 3 20 92.66 2000 .08 .08 10. 90 July 552 080.02

151-56

001.02

V61-05

10.10

219.19

52

10V 28

51

VSL IN

0.70.75 .70.75

.0

210.01

- 17 - BB

652.94

11.122

17.653

10. 5° . 01

177.08

016.14

2002

60. 60. 60. 60. 60.

1.200

r r.

00.

Set

4

.04

1000 V

-5°-00-0-20

crob

55 120 11 CO

.25

192.08

12.08

1.1 871

180.00

015

1.0.00

191-69

100 - 100 V

000

501-C28

. V. 00.

67.294

51.00

300

02.008

501

~

10.102

63.9h

69.93

0000

. 65. 9. . 65. 9.

20.00

005.00

19.73

121.51

99.995

13.50

NO.Y.

292

541.28

10.001

No. 1. 10 33 1.

13:001

81.201

53.020

23.765

050.924

23.121

0.709

NA. 71

5

19 109

30.

250.50

38.161

250

14.00

6.512

34

51.322

13.16

10.38

10.00

- AF

09.131

19:50

2.

20.00

0

12.11

20.13

52.11

50.200

40 NOS

63.032

650

000000

1200

592.24

12.09

100

11-08

2.09.2

0000

80.240

01.000

012.21

09:09

10

Sr.

15.278

52.825

1.502 1.502

10.51

1. 8.011

04.000

25. 22.

11.28

and the second

19.198

63. 93. 133. 938 KS

13.291

28. BB

5

76.198

51.345

000

1.000

0go

00 AD - 50

1:05

15.026

1.

32.029

38.743

à

11.122

17.653

500,050

6.0. 77

252.28

S. S. S. 17 - CO 00 N20. -00 -00 -00

VOE: 24. 95. 5

6

69.69

1.0

.00 000

851-14

690. 690. 690. 690. 690.

cc. 16

2057

559.55

82.54

.20

67.294

2. 10. 2. 10.

51.949

000000

012.08

19.573

63.947

92.908

7.321

25

0.000

100

21.661

0.130

34.609

25.08

10.102

09.24

15.00

69.93

83.150

7.170

13:001

30.32

81.201

23.221

96.924

0.109

14.14

2. 21.20

72.098

36.501

38.161

6. 10 6.

13.63

3

3

11.11

29. 27. 19 29. 27.

10.140

51.322

23.989

53.53

0750

1055 JL

162.10

510.22

10 20 20 20 C

120.90

60.05

1100

886

100.001

020

000.02

110.00

1. I.

10.02

10:

111.00

6062

N

57.51

1054

66.68

692.95

19.91

60.00

01.61

2300

A VA & ALLAL & S A & S A

OF STAND

10004

10.01

53.020

23.765

54.322

73.10

10.38

10.00

50.200

S.

or.

13.094

9.033

22.121

2.

88. 15 M

or.

60.5TA

84.197

821

8°0,49

,n

05.052

500 - CO.

50.21

so.

27.00

2.

6.

69.932

22.

2 012 11 ·

VU.

. 2.

51.734

2

92

07.391

c16.6V

86.210

01.980

20 W 012.08

1200

1200

161

s.

75.278

52.825

A. 502

04.000

1758

10.51

1.74

68.511

25.00

12.920

13.291

18.98

1.003

22.00.

50.00

12.05

8969

162.51

036021

00.02

12000

N.V.

10.01

101

5 S 162.00 90 90 90 90

200 . 200 . 200

851.14

6996

. vo

2005

559.501

90, 52, 60 90, 52, 60 90, 52, 60

.20

33

6.

66.281

200 La.

82.823

87.293

10.01

84.15

1. 20. 22

63.129

92.179

1031.03

37.196

30.534

31.739

1.283

80.11

53.982

31.12

10.

00.

210

\$.

3

2.

\$

n.

03.668

67.301

11.661

76.76

87.375

16.021

52.098

17. 82. 199 h

10.532

23.662

N1.078

-01. 09.095

98.913

108-108-10 108-108-10

S.

10.00

05.233

85.005

20.354

072

54.014

15.001

50.18

51.330

c0602

25 10.05

600

292.051

000001

10.00 V. 00 V.

02.08

15.721

69.96

250 05 05

106.04

198. 198.

c1664

54.5

102.13

0 20 11.22

19.198

12.000

51.343

20. 00.00

34.018

31.251

8. c2.

15.014

\* 29. N. 22. 25. 26. 68. 14.

17.127

15

2. 91.

0

11.80

94.550

11.924

9.228

50.139

64.55

83.579

70.8MA

5

84.57

S.

66.66

10.00

18.003

10:310

29. LD

01.000

92.902

10.080

62.347

22.766

NA. 878

14.00

00. 11.00

10.501

18.152

86.56

1.605

15.020

67.217

63.032

5

S.

16.312

6.129

67.672

81.91

55.194

07.891

22.682.151

10.000

8.202

59.122

81.382

66.79

202

Nº.

83.104

8. S. T.

20.000

12.691

91.255

82.891

12.903

77.916

73.991

14:05

6000

80.N1

6. S. S.

A1.75A

55.15.

72.004

20.00

23.164

13.000

29:08

75.293

10.00

50

2.

30.01

92.292

N. 1. 100

19:00

26.00

15.11

29.23.23

20.13

32.11

76.198

32.029

30.723

20.282

17.653

5 63.84 69.93

5. 10. 10. 10.

12.001

91:01

7.321

0.088

2.001.001

2.22.002

51. 155 S

6. 6. C. C.

17.002

1.50

11.09

20.00

92.1M

P.

33

200

.0.

2.

21.664

10.100

16.293

13.013

31.221

62.42

13.511

2. 4. S.

81.01

18.974

8.

é

10.00

22.21.634

82.3

7. 0.

3. 3.

ç

34.609

à

02.00

85.08 08

10.102

5.

15.00

00. 0.

22. 63. 4.

~

5

5.00

81.201

13:01

N 1530 200 121.09

5.01

.cv

60.00

1

.8

100.00

865.57

50

60° 5° 4

·So.

50°.54

10.50

50.02 02

.20

109.52

N. Co

120.00

640

20101

00.00

er.

0

0

20

682 40.

5

.00

Su

000

.du

- c2. c9.

6.

800

N. 900

3

3

5. 30°. 1

200

120 6000

.2

.00

5.02

R. La

124.02

0.00

102

.00.

1200

0,20

20.02

.02

VN1 26

110

V10.91

10.18

.0

12.20

6.01

Con Con

57. 20. 20. 21.

0.0000

124

eses . 12

818.14

500.21.2.08.09.00 100.11.2.08.09.00

8000

6

S. S.

V62.18

60.00

6.96

TP: Ag

Nº.01

619.08

200. 04 5 . L.

25014

206.26

A CALL ST CALLS

251.84

C09:1

10,21

282.02

5.05 S

2234

200.000

50.28

864.91

861.64

.V.

SNº LSI

10.92 V. 01

871.05

068.01

50.00

11,25

53. 53. 53. 53.

157 55

20025

63.032

S.

11.57

50.02

50000

151.60

198

12.

323

25

o.

76.198

30

32.029

38.13

20.20

12.07

04.

11 - C-2 - C

00000

#### **Perspective taking**

- The students demonstrated an ability to adopt the victims' perspectives
- They managed to identify with the precariousness of the victimized protagonists while acknowledging the potentially long-term and devastating effects of verbal harassment or intimidation.
- One of them stated: "I think it's very painful. I think it really sticks with you. Deeply. Maybe even for years afterwards. [...] eventually you start doubting yourself and others [...]."
- However, they admitted that intervening might come at a high cost, as they would risk becoming unpopular or subject to bullying themselves.

#### Fantasy

- Many students stated that they **identified with the feelings of the protagonist** experiencing harassment or ostracism in the simulated stories.
- After experiencing the various simulated scenes, the students described emotions such as feeling unsafe, disturbed, upset, scared, shocked, or sad, or, more explicitly, "having a knot in the stomach."
- They **identified with the girl being harassed with sexual comments** in the hallway, feeling hurt or lonely, as well as with the fear of the girl whose intimate video circulated.
- When approached as the person who was not invited to a party in the virtual simulation, **they easily put themselves in the shoes of the outsider**, sharing her feelings of distress and rejection.

#### **Emotional concern**

- Several students **felt sorry for the protagonists** who experienced verbal harassment or exclusion in the simulated stories.
- Reflecting on the situations afterward, they expressed a sense of responsibility to intervene in similar circumstances, either by comforting the victim, defending her against the offenders, or by trying to include her.
- However, the fear of being excluded held them back.
- Intervening could be even more difficult if popular peers carried out the harassment, as one of them stated: "I would have wanted to [help], but it's not always that easy. [...] You might not be as well-liked by the friends you're with."



#### **Personal distress**

- Watching the simulated situations even created feelings of apprehensiveness and helplessness in the students.
- These emotions were often connected to the role of being a bystander, observing peers suffer yet feeling unable, or even unwilling, to intervene due to fear of potential reprisals.
- When asked what might happen if he intervened in a bullying situation, one student stated: "You could've been yelled at in return — that they'd talk back and say mean things about you."
- They openly described the tension between the desire to help on one side and being restrained by anxiety on the other, as intervening might lead to a loss of reputation or social standing, or even result in being treated similarly to the victim.



#### **Results & implications**

- The portrayal of ethically challenging dilemmas in immersive 360-degree video facilitated access to emotional responses and autoethnographic reflection.
- The qualitative analysis showed that eliciting emotional responses and autoethnographic reflection connected to personal distress (PD) may open perspective-taking (PT) potentially leading to pro-social behavior.
- Identification (FS) with the protagonists in the 360-degree videos triggered emotional concern (EC), which was unanticipated by Davis' theory, yet confirming empathy as a multidimensional construct.
- The study offers empirical nuances to Rosa's resonance theory by demonstrating that the co-creation and engagement with VR environments can facilitate moments of **affective attunement**.



#### References

[1] Utdanningsdirektoratet. (January 13, 2025). "Mobbetallene øker ikke lenger, men er fortsatt høye." ["Bullying rates are no longer increasing, but they remain high."] <u>https://www.udir.no/tall-og-forskning/statistikk/analyser/2025/elevundersokelsen-2024/</u> Accessed on May 23, 2025.

[2] UNESCO. (2019). Behind the numbers: Ending school violence and bullying. 2019, Paris.

[3] UNESCO. "Prevention of violence and bullying in school", 2023. [Accessed 19.05.25].

https://www.unesco.org/gem-report/en/articles/prevention-violence-and-bullying-school?

[4] Gaffney, H., Farrington, D. P., & Ttofi, M. M., "Examining the effectiveness of school-bullying intervention programs globally: A meta-analysis.", International Journal of Bullying Prevention, 1(1), Springer, 2019, 14–31. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s42380-019-0007-4</u>

[5] Van Noorden, T. H. J., "Mechanisms in bullying and victimization: Target specific empathy and human characteristics attribution." Ph.d.-thesis, Behavioural Science Institute, 2016, DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.1.1302.8724

[6] Kokkinos, C. M., & Kipritsi, E., "The relationship between bullying, victimization, trait emotional intelligence, self-efficacy and empathy among preadolescents",

Social Psychology of Education, 15(1), 2012, 41–58. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11218-011-9168-9

[7] Gaffney, H., Ttofi, M. M., & Farrington, D. P., "Evaluating the effectiveness of school-bullying prevention programs: An updated meta-analytical review." Aggression and Violent Behavior, 45, Elsevier, 2019, 111–133. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.avb.2018.07.001

[8] Barreda-Ángeles, M.; Serra-Blasco, M.; Trepat, E.; Perada-Baños, A.; Pàmias, M.; Palao, D., Goldberg, X., Cardoner, N., "Development and experimental validation of a dataset of 360videos for facilitating school-based bullying prevention programs", Computers & Education 161; 104065, Elsevier, 2021. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2020.104065

[9] Travena, L.; Paay, J.; McDonald, R., "VR interventions to induce empathy: a scoping review", Virtual Reality (28)80, Springer, 2024, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-024-00946-9

[10] Martingano, A. J.; Herrera, F.; Konrath, S., "Virtual Reality Improves Emotional but Not Cognitive Empathy: A Meta-Analysis", Technology, Mind, and Behaviour (2)1, American Psychological Association, 2021. https://doi.org/10.1037/tmb0000034

[11] Yalçın, Ö. N., & DiPaola, S., "Modeling empathy: building a link between affective and cognitive processes", Artificial Intelligence Review, 53(4), Springer, 2020, 2983-3006.

[12] Shin, D. B., "Exploring the Role of Virtual Reality Perspective Taking on Teachers' Cognitive Empathy: An Action Research Study", Dissertations, Theses, and Masters Projects. The College of William & Mary. Paper 1627407556, 2021, https://scholarworks.wm.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=7150&context=etd (Accessed on May 29, 2025)

[13] Ventura, S., Cardenas, G., Miragall, M., Riva, G., & Baños, R., "How Does It Feel to Be a Woman Victim of Sexual Harassment? The Effect of 360°-Video-Based Virtual Reality on Empathy and Related Variables", Cyberpsychology, Behavior, and Social Networking, 24(4), Mary Ann Liebert Inc.pub, 2021, 258–266. https://doi.org/10.1089/cyber.2020.0209

[14] Nilsson, N. C., Nordahl, R., & Serafin, S., "Immersion Revisited: A review of existing definitions of immersion and their relation to different theories of presence", Human Technology, 12(2), Centre of Sociological Research, 2016,108–134. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.17011/ht/um.201611174652</u>

[15] Davis, M. H. "A multidimensional Approach to Individual Differences in Empathy", Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 10(85), 1980, 1-20.

[16] Davis, M. H., "Measuring Individual Differences in Empathy: Evidence for a Multidimensional Approach", Journal of Personality and Social Psychology 44(1), 1983, 113-126.

[17] Ventura, S.; Badenes-Ribera, L.; Herrero, R. & Cebolla, A. Galiana, L. & Baños, R. Virtual Reality as a Medium to Elicit Empathy: A Meta-Analysis. Cyberspychology, Behavior, and Social Networking, 23(10), Mary Ann Liebert Inc., 2020, <a href="https://doi.org/10.1089/cyber.2019.0681">https://doi.org/10.1089/cyber.2019.0681</a>

[18] Radianti, J.; Steig, M. H.; Wass, S. & Safari, M. C., "Exploring Immersive VR-based Empathtic Learning Using Interpersonal Reactivity Index", Proceedings of the 57th International Conference on System Sciences, 2024, 5307-5316. https://hdl.handle.net/10125/107022

[19] Säks, E., "Using Cinematic Virtual Reality to Get Acquainted with the Metaverse", Baltic Screen Media Review, Walter de Gruyter GmbH, 2022, https://doi.org/10.2478/BSMR-2022-0019

[20] Dooley, K., "A question of proximity: Exploring a new screen grammar for 360-degree cinematic virtual reality", Media Practice and Education 21, 2, 81–96. 2020, https://doi.org/10.1080/25741136.2019.1641005

[21] Teding van Berkhout E, Malouff JM. "The efficacy of empathy training: A meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials", Journal of Counseling Psychology, 63(32), APA PsycNet, 2016, https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1037/cou0000130

[22] Shanafelt TD, West C, Zhao X, Novotny, P.; Kolars, J., Habermann, T. & Sloan, J., "Relationship between increased personal well-being and enhanced empathy among internal medicine residents." Journal of General Internal Medicine, 20(7), PubMed, 2005, 559–564.

[23] Kunnskapsdepartementet. (2019). Læreplan i kristendom, religion, livssyn og etikk (KRLE) (RLE01-03). Utdanningsdirektoratet. https://www.udir.no/lk20/rle01-03 (Accessed on May 29, 2025)

[24] Milk, C. How virtual reality can create the ultimate empathy machine. TED, 2015. <u>https://youtu.be/iXHil1TPxvA?si=\_t4dmDmeLRmRMqcH</u> (Accessed on May 21, 2025)

[25] Freina, L., & Ott, M., "A literature review on immersive virtual reality in education: state of the art and perspectives." The international scientific conference e-learning and software for education, 2015.

#### https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/16050855/

[26] Trevena, L.; Paay, J. & McDonald, R., "VR interventions aimed to induce empathy: a scoping review", Virtual Reality, 28(80), Springer, 2024, 1-49 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-024-00946-9

[27] Rosa, H. Resonance: A Sociology of Our Relationship to the World. Translated by James C. Wagner, Polity Press, 2019.

[28] Braun, V. & Clarke, V. Thematic analysis. A practical guide, SAGE, 2022.

[29] Hatch, J. A. (2002). Doing qualitative research in educational settings, pp. 152-161. State University of New York Press.